

# PATHOLOGICAL, BIOCHEMICAL AND MOLECULAR CHARACTERIZATION OF THE SEED-BORNE BACTERIA "PANTOEA SPP., XANTHOMONAS SPP. AND PSEUDOMONAS SPP." FROM SOLANACEOUS PLANTS IN EGYPT

Nader A. Ashmawy<sup>1</sup>, Alia A. Shoeib<sup>1</sup>, Hanan F. B. Youssef<sup>2</sup> and Said M. Mahmoud<sup>2</sup>

### Address(es):

ARTICLE INFO

Received 23. 8. 2019

Revised 12. 6. 2020

Accepted 29. 6. 2020

Published 1, 10, 2020

Regular article

<sup>1</sup>Plant Pathology Department, Faculty of Agriculture, Alexandria University, Egypt. <sup>2</sup>Plant Protection Institute, Agricultural Research Center (ARC), Egypt.

ABSTRACT

\*Corresponding author: nader\_pcr@yahoo.com

The seed-borne bacterial diseases of family solanaceae cause significant economic losses worldwide. In the present study, fourteen bacterial isolates were recovered from seeds of different varieties of tomato, eggplant, black nightshade and tobacco. The seed samples were collected from different locations in Egypt. Isolated bacteria were identified based on morphological, physiological and biochemical tests as well as colonial morphology aspects on the differential medium, yeast extract dextrose calcium carbonate (YDC) besides the selective media (PA 20, King's B and Tween B). Pathogenicity of the isolated bacteria was assessed for causing graywall, bacterial speck and bacterial spot symptoms on tomato seedlings. Disease symptoms were recognized on leaves and stems of the inoculated seedlings. Re-isolation from collected seeds of the inoculated tomato plants was performed. Results indicated that *Pantoea* spp. was an endophytic bacteria, *Pseudomonas* spp. was an epiphytic bacteria, while *Xanthomonas* spp. was both epiphytic and endophytic bacteria. Furthermore, cellular fatty acids composition were identified and quantified to give a profile for tested bacterial isolates. Moreover, the bacterial isolates were identified at the molecular level via PCR reactions utilizing the 16S rRNA gene. Partial DNA sequences were analyzed using BLAST tool revealed that the inferred 16S rRNA partial sequences of the 7 isolates. To the best of our knowledge the bacterium associated with the graywall seems to be first report of *P. ananatis* isolated from tomato fruits and black nightshade seeds in Egypt.

Keywords: seed borne bacteria, solanaceae, fatty acids, 16S rRNA, PA20

## INTRODUCTION

Seed production has been moved to semi-arid regions to escape seed-borne pathogens. Seed-borne bacterial diseases continue to be problematic and cause significant economic losses worldwide. Infested seeds are responsible for there-emergence of diseases of the past, movement of pathogens across international borders, or the introduction of diseases into new areas (Gitaitis andWalcott, 2007).

Family Solanaceae, included important economical, medicinal crops and weeds in the world. One of them is Tomato (*Lycopersicon esculentum* Mill.) which cultivated for its fruits, having economic importance for domestic consumption, export and food industries. Egypt ranks fifth in the world for tomato production, 6.62 million metric tons (**FAO**, **2018**).

Tomato seeds are subjected to infection by bacterial seed-borne diseases such as graywall disease caused by *Pantoea ananatis* [formerly, *Erwinia ananas*] (Stall *et al.*, 1970 and Boyle, 1994). The genus *Pantoea* is a diverse group of yellow-pigmented, rod shaped Gram-negative bacteria in the family *Enterobacteriaceae*. Some of the first members were recognized as plant pathogens causing wilting, soft rot and necrosis in different host plants (Walterson and Stavrinides, 2015). *P. ananatis* causes disease symptoms in a wide range of economically important agricultural crops and forest tree species worldwide, which associated with plants as an epiphyte and endophyte bacteria (Coutinho and Venter, 2009 ; Gi Yoon Shin *et al.*, 2019).

Moreover, bacterial speck disease of tomato which caused by *Pseudomonas syringae* pv. *tomato* can also reduce yield when it severely affects leaves early in the growing season. The diseases is developed due to high humidity and low night temperatures (Kolomiets *et al.*, 2017). The bacterium can be moved from plant to plant via splashing water or on hands and gardening tools causes a serious outbreak on tomato plants grown in commercial fields (Sahin, 2001; Shenge *et al.*, 2010).

Bacterial spot of tomato, caused by Xanthomonas vesicatoria, is a potentially devastating disease that can lead to unmarketable fruit and even plant

death. Bacterial spots can occur wherever tomatoes are grown, but are found most frequently in warm, wet climates, as well as in greenhouses (Shenge et al., 2010; Kolomiets et al., 2017). The pathogens enter plants through natural openings (e.g., stomates), as well as through wounds. Disease development is favored by warm, wet weather. Wind-driven rain can contribute to more severe disease as the pathogens are splashed and spread to healthy leaves and fruit. The species-specific PCR assays, biochemical and serological analyses were used to identify the *Xanthomonas* species associated with bacterial leaf spot of tomato as diagnostic protocols for this disease (Manjula et al., 2017; Roach et al., 2018; Vancheva et al., 2018). Therefore, the present study was conducted to achieve the following objectives: to isolate the seed-borne bacterial pathogens from solanaceous plants collected from different locations in Egypt, to identify and characterize the isolated bacteria through cultural, biochemical tests and fatty acid profiling ,as well as, molecular techniques through 16S rRNA gene sequences.

doi: 10.15414/jmbfs.2020.10.2.289-295

## MARERIALS AND METHODS

## Sampling collection

Seeds of different varieties of some selected vegetable crops and weeds which belonging to family Solanaceae were collected as following: 6 varieties of tomato seeds (*Solanum esculentum*) namely Castle Rock, Super strain B, Peto 86, Super Jakal, Gs 12 and local variety were purchased from local markets at Alexandria Governorate. Moreover, one tomato seed sample of Super Jakal variety was obtained from naturally infected fruits collected from Assiut Governorate. Two varieties of eggplant seeds (*S. melongena*) namely local variety and Black Beauty, as well as, one local variety of peper seeds (*Capsicum annuum*) were purchased from local markets at Alexandria (*Datura stramonium* and *D. metel*), tobacco (*Nicotiana tabacum*) and black nightshade (*S. nigrum*) were obtained from Plant Pathology Institute, Agricultural

Research Center (ARC), Giza, Egypt. The above mentioned varieties were used for isolation trials.

## **Isolation procedures**

Isolation and detection of presumptive bacterial isolates from the above mentioned seed varieties were carried out using either dilution plating of seed extracts on semi-selective media or direct seed plating methods, as well as, liquid assay (LA) method.

Symptomless and morphologically infected seed samples were divided into 2 groups (I, II) for isolation trials. In group I, seeds were non surface sterilized to detect epiphytic. In group II seeds were surface sterilized to detect only the endophytic bacteria. Then seeds were macerated in the phosphate buffer saline (PBS-Tween 20). All seed varieties in each group were incubated overnight for 14 hrs at 4°C in the same buffer at a ratio of 3 mL of buffer to 1 gram of seeds (v:w). (www.wordseed.org/--/Tomato\_Xanthomonas\_spp\_010).

Ten-fold serial dilutions of either seed suspension or its extracts in PBS buffer were prepared. The resultant dilutions (0.1 mL) was spread onto two semi selective media, PA 20 medium for isolation of *Pantoea* spp. (Goszczynskaet al., 2006) and Tween B medium for *Xanthomonas* spp.(McGuire et al., 1986 andGore and O'Garro, 1999). Colonies observed after 4-7 days at 28°C were isolated and purified through the single colony isolation technique. Colonies were transferred on a yeast extract-dextrose-CaCO<sub>3</sub> (YDC) medium (Gitaitiset al., 1991) for further identification. Cultures were kept on nutrient agar (NA) medium for further studies.

### Direct plating on semi-selective media and liquid assay methods

These methods were used for detection of *Pseudomonas* spp. from non-surface sterilized seeds (Group I). In direct plating method, 100 seed of each variety were planted on King's B medium (King *et al.* 1954). Seeds were distributed in ten plates, 10 seeds in each plate then incubated at 28°C for 4-5 days.

In liquid assay method, 0.1 gram of non-surface sterilized seeds of each variety was soaked in 10 mL sterile saline solution (0.85% NaCl) for 24 hrs at room temperature  $25\pm2$  °C then, 0.1 mL of the suspension aliquots were spread on King's B medium. Isolated colonies were transferred on YDC medium for further identification.

### Pathogenicity tests

## Inoculation of tomato seedlings

Pure cultures of (P) and (X) bacterial isolates were cultivated on NA medium for 48 hrs. at 28°C, whereas, (Ps) isolates was cultivated on King's B (KB) medium for 48 hrs at 28°C. Bacterial cells were collected and suspended in sterile distilled water (SDW). In case of (P) isolates, bacterial suspension was adjusted to ca. 10<sup>7</sup> CFU/mL. Four weeks-old tomato seedlings (Alissa F1 variety) were inoculated by injecting bacterial suspension into the stem. Then, stem-inoculated plants were placed in plastic bags to increase the relative humidity (RH) and maintained in a greenhouse. The development of symptoms was recorded after 15 days. In case of (Ps) and (X), bacterial suspensions (ca. 10<sup>8</sup> CFU/mL) were atomized with a hand-held sprayer until run-off. After inoculation, plants were placed in plastic bags and maintained in a greenhouse. Development of symptoms was observed daily (**Milijasevic** *et al.*, **2009**). Control plants were treated in a similar way using sterile water. All inoculation tests were replicated three times.

### Inoculation of tomato fruits

Immature tomato fruits (Alissa F1 variety) were inoculated with the suspension of (P) isolates by injection the bacterial suspension (ca. 10<sup>7</sup> CFU/mL) into the fruits using sterile syringe. Disease symptoms were recorded after 14 days. Healthy fruits injected by sterile water were served as a control.

### Re-isolation from artificially infected tomato

## **Tomato Seedlings and fruits**

Re-isolation from tomato seedlings was performed after 6 weeks from artificial infection. Leaves and stems of infected tomato seedlings (Alissa F1variety) were gently washed with tap water, cut into small pieces and soaked into a few drops of SDW for 30 min. The resultant suspension was streaked on nutrient agar (NA) medium. Bacterial spots and speck lesions were excised and surface sterilized by dipping in 70% ethanol for 2 seconds followed by two successive rinses in SDW. Lesions were crushed in 0.5 mL SDW, and the resultant suspension was streaked on NA medium. All inoculated plates were incubated for 3 days at 28°C and a single colony of the predominant colonies was selected and purified by repeated streaking on the same medium, then examined for further studies. Moreover, reisolation was performed from fruits showing disease symptoms as previously mentioned.

### **Tomato seeds**

Re-isolation from seeds which collected from tomato fruits was performed after 9 weeks from artificial infection of tomato seedlings as previously described (**EL-Meneisy**, **2005**).

### Identification of bacterial isolates

### Cultural, morphological, physiological and biochemical Tests

Bacterial isolates were identified using cultural, morphological, physiological and biochemical characteristics, which were conducted by performing the standard tests (Abd-Alla, 2000; Brenner *et al.*, 2005; Brady*et al.*, 2009; Deletoile *et al.*, 2009 and Al-Saleh, 2011). The above mentioned tests were applied on the obtained bacterial isolates which included: cell shape, sporulation, motility, Gram staining, catalase, oxidase, starch hydrolysis, gelatin liquefaction, arginine dihydrolase, nitrate reduction, levan production and acid production from mannose, cellobiose, mannitol and sorbitol.

Cultural characteristics of the bacterial isolates were studied on different culture media such as PA 20 medium for *Pantoea* spp., King's B medium for *Pseudomonas* spp. and Tween B medium for *Xanthomonas* spp., glycerol agar, NA and YDC media were used, also bacterial growth of *Pseudomonas* spp. and *Xanthomonas* spp. isolates was tested on PA 20 medium (Goszczynska et al., 2006a).

### Fatty acids analysis

## Extraction of total cellular lipids

Total lipids were extracted from seven bactrerial isolates grown on NB medium for 48 hrs as described by **Kates (1972)**. Bacterial cells were harvested after growth for 24 hrs at room temperature with occasional shaking by centrifugation at 3000 g for 10min. Bacterial pellet (0.5 g) was transferred to screw cape tube capacity 20 mL and extracted with 5 mL methanol-chloroform mixture (2:1 v/w). The organic layer was transferred to another tube, and 5 ml of methanol-chloroform mixture was added to re-extract the pellet for 2 hrs.

The organic solvent was decanted and collected to the first extract 2.5 mL chloroform and 2.5 mL of distilled water were add to each tube, mixed well, and left for phases separation. The chloroform lower layer containing total lipids was withdrawn into a screw cape tube 20 mL capacity. Chloroform was evaporated at 40°C under stream of nitrogen and the traces of water were removed by drops of benzene. Total lipids extract was kept refrigerated under nitrogen (N<sub>2</sub>) gas.

### Preparation of methyl esters of fatty acids

The methyl esters of fatty acids (MEsFA) were prepared from total lipids as described by **Radwan (1978)**. The total lipids extract in the screw cape tube was dissolved in 2.0 mL benzene and 10 mL of the esterification reagent (1% sulphuric acid in absolute methanol) were added. The tubes were caped under nitrogen and heated at 90°C for 90 minutes. Ten mL of distilled water were added to the cooled tubes and the MEsFA were extracted with 5 mL benzene and the extracts were dried using anhydrous sodium sulfate (5 g), received in 10 mL capacity vials, kept under N<sub>2</sub> and used for gas liquid chromatography (GLC) analysis.

### Gas liquid chromatography of MEsFA

The MEsFA were analyzed using Shimadzu-8 A, GLC equipped with flam ionization detector and ordinary glass column (ID 3 mm X 2.5 m.) of 5 % diethylene glycol succinate on chromosorb Q 80/100 mesh. The following conditions were used for GLC analysis:column temperature 160°C, detector temperature 270°C, flow rates of nitrogen 20 mL/ min, H<sub>2</sub> 75 mL/ min, air 0.5 mL/ min, chart speed 2.5 mm/ min. Standard MEsFA and their retention times were used for identification. The area under each peak was measured by the triangulation methods and expressed as percentage of each fatty acid with regard to the total area.

### Molecular identification

#### Extraction of genomic DNA

Bacterial genomic DNA was extracted by boiling one mL of a suspension containing ca.  $1 \times 10^{10}$  CFU/mL for 10 min. DNA was separated by centrifugation for 5 min at 11.000 xg (Yahiaoui-Zaidiet *al.*,2003).

### PCR amplification of 16S rRNA gene

Full length (1550 bp) of 16S rRNA gene was amplified from 3 isolates of *Pantoea* spp. (P<sub>1</sub>, P<sub>2</sub> and P<sub>3</sub>),2 isolates of *Pseudomonas* spp. (Ps<sub>1</sub> and Ps<sub>2</sub>), and 2 isolates of *Xanthomonas* spp. (X<sub>1</sub> and X<sub>2</sub>) using the universal primers P0(F)

# $({\bf 5'} GAAGAGTTTGATCCTGGCTCAG{\bf 3'}),$

P6(R)

(5'CTACGGCTACCTTGTGTTACGA3'). PCR amplification was carried out in a total volume 50  $\mu$ L containing 5  $\mu$ L 10 x buffer, 4  $\mu$ L 25 mM MgCl<sub>2</sub>, 4  $\mu$ L 2.5 mMdNTPs, 2  $\mu$ L 10 pmol forward primer, 2  $\mu$ L 10 pmol reverse primer, 2  $\mu$ L 50 ng of bacterial genomic DNA and 0.4  $\mu$ L (5 units/  $\mu$ L) Taq DNA polymerase - Promega, Germany. PCR amplification was performed in a thermal cycler (Techne,UK) programmed for one cycle at 95°C for 5 min followed by 34 cycles each with 45 s at 95°C for denaturation, 1 min at 50°C for annealing and 2 min at 72°C for elongation. Reaction mixture was then incubated at 72°C for 10 min for final extension (Ashmawy *et al.*, 2015).

### PCR product of electrophoresis and visualization

Two  $\mu$ L of loading dye was added prior to loading of 10  $\mu$ l per gel slot. Electrophoresis was performed at 100 volt with 0.5 x Tris-EDTA-borate (TBE) (Tris base, 108 g/L boric acid, 55 g/L and 0.5 M EDTA with a pH of 8, 40 ml for 10 x) as running buffer in 1.5% agarose gel cast in 0.5 x TBE gel and then the gel was stained in 0.5  $\mu$ g/mL (w/v) ethidium bromide solution and distained in deionized water. Finally, the gel was visualized with a UV transilluminator at 254 nm.

## **Purification of PCR products**

QIAquick PCR purification kit (Qiagen, Germany) was used to purify the amplified products of 16S rRNA gene.

# Sequencing of 16S rRNA gene

The amplified product (1550 bp) of 16S rRNA was sequenced by Big Dye terminator cycle sequencing kit. Sequencing products were purified using Centri-Sep spin columns and were resolved on an ABIPRISM model 310 automated DNA sequencer at the Sigma Scientific Services Company.

## Alignment and phylogenetic analysis

Pair-wise and multiple DNA sequence alignment were carried out using CLUSTALW (1.82) <u>http://www.ebi.ac.uk/clustalw</u>. Bootstrap neighbor-joining tree generated using MEGA version 7.0 (Kumar et al., 2016) from CLUSTALW alignment. Comparisons with sequences in the GenBank database were achieved in BLASTN searches at the National Center for Biotechnology Information site (<u>http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov</u>). The obtained sequences in the current study were deposited in European Nucleotide Archive (ENA) under accession numbers from LN880270 to LN880276.

## RESULTS

## Isolation trials from collected seeds

Seed samples of different varieties of tomato, eggplant, tobacco, black nightshade, pepper and datura were collected in this study. Only one seed sample was obtained from naturally infected tomato fruits (Super jakal variety) showed typical symptoms of gray wall disease.

Different bacterial colonies were observed on glycerol agar, nutrient agar, yeast extract dextrose-CaCo3 (YDC), as well as, semi selective media, PA20, King's B and Tween B (Table 1). According to their colonies characteristics on the previous semi selective media, three types of bacterial isolates were detected: Type I [typical colonies of *Pantoea* spp. (P<sub>1</sub>, P<sub>2</sub>, P<sub>3</sub>, P<sub>4</sub> and P<sub>5</sub>)] on PA20 medium, colonies were yellow, 3–4 mm in diameter, shiny, drop shaped with small, granular, darker inclusions inside and yellow lighter zones around colonies, Type II [Typical colonies of *Pseudomonas* spp. (Ps<sub>1</sub>, Ps<sub>2</sub>, Ps<sub>3</sub>, Ps<sub>4</sub>, Ps<sub>5</sub> and P<sub>6</sub>)] on King's B medium, colonies were white, circular and mucoid and Type III [typical colonies of *Xanthomonas* spp. (X<sub>1</sub>, X<sub>2</sub> and X<sub>3</sub>)] on Tween B medium, colonies were raised, circular and yellow surrounded by zones of white crystals giving a fried-egg appearance (Fig.1).

## Pathogenicity tests

### **Tomato seedlings**

All the bacterial isolates Type I ( $P_1, P_2, P_3, P_4$  and  $P_5$ ), Type II ( $Ps_1, Ps_2, Ps_3, Ps_4$ ,  $Ps_5$  and  $P_6$ ) and Type III ( $X_1, X_2$  and  $X_3$ ) were tested for their pathogenicity on tomato seedlings Alissa F1 and Gs Nada varieties. Inoculation with isolates of type I, stems appeared shrivel and wither, moreover, discolored water-conducting tissue and chlorosis was appeared on leaves (Figs. 2) which were suspected to belong to *Pantoea* spp. Inoculation with isolates of type II showed necrotic spots surrounded by a chlorotic halo appearing on leaves (Fig. 3) which were suspected to belong to *Pseudomonas* spp. In case of inoculation with type III bacterial isolates, leaves appeared water soaked lesions and became brown color (Fig. 4) which was suspected to belong to *Xanthomonas* spp.

 Table 1 Isolates and colony type of seed-borne bacteria isolated from different seed cultivars on semi-selective media

Seed samples	Media	Colony type	Isolate code			
Tomato cultivars						
Castle rock	PA 20 I*		$P_4$			
Super strain B	King's B II		$Ps_1$			
Peto 86	Tween B	Tween B III X <sub>1</sub> ,				
Gs 12	King's B - II-III Ps Tween B		Ps <sub>2</sub> , X <sub>3</sub>			
	PA 20	Ι	$P_2$			
Local variety 1	King's B	-	-			
	Tween B	-	-			
Local variety 2	PA 20	-	-			
	King's B	-	-			
	Tween B	-	-			
Super jakal	PA 20	Ι	$\mathbf{P}_1$			
	Eggpla	nt cultivars				
Black beauty	King's B	II	Ps <sub>3</sub> , Ps <sub>4</sub> , Ps <sub>5</sub> , Ps <sub>6</sub>			
-	PA 20	-	-			
Local variety	al variety King's B		-			
-	Tween B	-	-			
Black nightshade	PA 20	Ι	$P_3$			
Tobacco	PA 20	Ι	P <sub>5</sub>			
Pepper cultivar						
	PA 20	-	-			
(Local variety)	King's B	-	-			
	Tween B	-	-			
	D	atura				
	PA 20	-	-			
	King's B	-	-			
	Tween B	-	-			

\* Type I, yellow colonies, 3–4 mm in diameter, shiny, drop shaped, Type II, white colonies, circular and mucoid and Type III, yellow colonies surrounded by zones of white crystals. (-), no colonies were detected.



**Figure 1** Typical colonies of *Pantoea* spp. ( $P_1$  isolate) on PA 20 medium, *Pseudomonas* spp. ( $P_{s_2}$  isolate) on King's B medium and *Xanthomonas* spp. ( $X_1$  isolate) on Tween B medium.



**Figure 2** Artificially infected tomato seedlings "Alissa F1" with Type I isolates (P<sub>1</sub>, P<sub>2</sub>, P<sub>3</sub> and P<sub>4</sub>) of *Pantoea* spp. Showing yellowness on leaves (arrows).



**Figure 3** Artificially infected tomato seedlings "Alissa F1" with Type II isolates ( $Ps_1$  and  $Ps_2$ ) of *Pseudomonas* spp. showing necrotic spots surrounded by a chlorotic halo appearing on leaves (arrows).



**Figure 4** Artificially infected tomato seedlings "Alissa F1" with Type III isolates  $(X_1 \text{ and } X_2)$  of *Xanthomonas* spp. showing water soaked lesions on leaves which became brown colour (arrows).

## **Tomato fruits**

All isolates of *Pantoea* spp. (P) were tested for their pathogenicity on tomato fruits (Alissa F1) and showed grey areas around the inoculation site (Fig. 5).

## Re-isolation from artificially infected seedlings

## Tomato seedlings and fruits

Re-isolation from infected seedlings with isolated bacteria appeared identical to those colonies of *Pantoea* spp., *Pseudomonas* spp. and *Xanthomonas* spp. Re-isolation from inoculated fruits on selective media produced yellow colonies typical to *Pantoea* spp.



**Figure 5** Artificially infection of tomato fruits "Alissa F1" with type I (P3) isolate of *Pantoea* spp. showed typical graywall symptoms (right), compared with control treatment (left).

### **Tomato seeds**

Re-isolation from non-surface sterilized seeds from infected seedlings with  $P_1$  isolate appeared typical graywall disease symptoms didn't revealed colonies identical to *Panteoa* spp. Otherwise non surface-sterilized seeds from infected seedlings with Ps2 isolate and X3 isolate showed typical bacterial speck and spot diseases symptoms and produced colonies identical to *Pseudomonas* spp. and *Xanthomonas* spp. respectively.

Re-isolation from macerated surface-sterilized seeds revealed colonies identical to *Pantoea* spp. ( $P_1$  isolate) and *Xanthomonas* spp. ( $X_1$  isolate), otherwise didn't revealed colonies identical to *Pseudomonas* spp. ( $P_{s_2}$  isolate).

 Table 2 Morphological traits, physiological and biochemical tests of Pantoea

 spp.(P, type I), Pseudomonas spp. (Ps, type II) and Xanthomonasspp.(X, type III)

Characteristics	Pantoea spp. (Type I)	Pseudomons spp. (Type II)	Xanthomonas spp. (Type III)		
Cell shape	short rods	short rods	short rods		
Gram Stain	-	-	-		
Spore formation	-	-	-		
Growth at 36°C	+	+	-		
Growth at 4°C	+	+	+		
Motility	+	+	+		
Catalase production	+	+	+		
Oxidase activity	-	-	-		
Hydrolysis of: Starch	-	-	-		
Casein	-	+	+		
Gelatine	+	+	+		
Urea	-	+	-		
Lipid (Lipase activity)	-	+	-		
Arginine dehydrolase	-	-	-		
Nitrate reduction	-	-	-		
Levan production	+	+	+		
Acid production from:					
Mannitol, Mannose, Sorbitol,	+	+	+		
Cellobiose					
Growth in the presence of:					
NaCl 4%	+	-	-		
Streptomycin (10 µg)	-	+	-		
Pathogenicity	+	+	+		
+ = Positive reaction -= Negative reaction					

# Identification of the seed borne bacterial isolates

Isolation process revealed three types of bacteria, type I, II and III which were short rods and non-spore formers and Gram Negative (Table 2). Data presented in Table (2) showed that all tested bacterial isolates *Pantoea* spp.(P, type I), *Pseudomonas* spp.(Ps, type II) and *Xanthomonas* spp. (X, type III) were positive for catalase, gelatin hydrolysis, levan production, negative for oxidase, starch hydrolysis, arginine dihydrolase and nitrate reduction. Whereas, all isolates were positive for acid production of mannitol, mannose, sorbitol and cellobiose. Some tests were revealed differentiation in their reaction among tested isolates.

Data presented in Table (3) and Figs. (6, 7 and 8) showed differences among colonies characteristics of *Pantoea* spp. (P, type I), *Pseudomonas* spp. (Ps, type II) and *Xanthomonas* spp.(X, type III) on different culture media.

Tested isolates of *Pseudomonas* spp. and *Xanthomonas* spp. couldn't grow on PA 20 medium compared with *Pantoea* spp. (Fig. 9).

Table 3 Colonial characteristics of Pantoea spp. (P, type I), Pseudomonas s	spp.
(Ps, type II) and <i>Xanthomonas</i> spp. (X, type III) on different culture media	

	Pantosa spp	Pseudomons	Xanthomonas	
Media	Tunioea spp. (Type I)	spp.	spp.	
	(15pc 1)	(Type II)	(Type III)	
	Yellow,	Beige,	Yellow,	
Glycerol agar	circular and	circular and	circular and	
	smooth	smooth	mucoid	
	Pale yellow,	White,	Pale yellow	
Nutrient agar	smooth and	circular and	circular and	
	translucent	smooth	smooth	
			Yellow,	
	Yellow, regularly		circular,	
Yeast extract	round and	White, circula	smooth, domed	
dextrose-CaCo3	mucoid	r, domed	and mucoid –	
(YDC)	surrounded by	and smooth	fluidal	
	clear ring		surrounded	
			byclear ring	
	Yellow, 3–4 mm			
	in diameter,			
	shiny drop			
PA 20	shaped with	-	-	
	small, granular			
	and darker			
	inclusions inside		37 11	
			Yellow	
Tween B	-	-	surrounded with	
			naio, raised and	
		white	circular	
Vingla P		willte,		
King's B	-	circular and	-	
		mucoia		

(-) = No growth



Figure 6 Typical colonies of *Pantoea* spp. (P, Type I) on Glycerol Agar (A), Nutrient Agar (B) and Yeast Extract Dextrose calcium carbonate agar (C).



Figure 7 Typical colonies of *Pseudomonas* spp. (Ps, type II) on Glycerol Agar (A), Nutrient Agar (B) and Yeast Extract Dextrose calcium carbonate agar (YDC) (C).



**Figure 8** Typical colonies of *Xanthomonas* spp (X, type III) on Glycerol Agar (A), Nutrient Agar (B) and Yeast Extract Dextrose calcium carbonate agar (YDC) (C).



**Figure 9** Bacterial growth of *Pantoea* spp. (P, Type I) on PA 20 selective medium. No growth appeared of *Pseudomonas* spp. (Ps, Type II) and *Xanthomonas* spp. (X, Type III) on PA 20 medium.

## Determination of cellular fatty acids composition

Fatty acids methyl esters (FAMEs) were identified and quantified to give a profile for tested isolates. Cellular fatty acid contents of isolates of *Pantoea* spp. (P<sub>1</sub>, P<sub>2</sub>, P<sub>3</sub>), *Pseudomonas* spp. (Ps<sub>1</sub>, Ps<sub>2</sub>) and *Xanthomonas* spp. (X<sub>1</sub>, X<sub>2</sub>) were determined and summarized in Table (4) as following:

The main data analyses of fatty acid compositions measured by percentage of total area of a fatty acid to all fatty acids in percentage (P) were used to obtain the ratio between the fatty acids values. The considered method for explanation of the

quantities and distribution of cellular fatty acids among all bacterial isolates, showed in presence of 18 fatty acids.

The major fatty acids detected in *Pantoea* spp. isolates were Dodecanoic (12:0),Tetradecanoic (14:0),Hexadecanoic(16:0) and Octadecanoic acids (18:0).whereas, the primary fatty acids found in *Pseudomonas* spp. isolates were Tetradecanoic (14:0) and Hexadecenoic acids (16:1). In case of *Xanthomonas* spp. isolates, the major fatty acids detected were Tetradecanoic(14:0), Pentadecanoic (15:0) and Hexadecanoic acids (16:0).

The fatty acids Tetradecenoic (14:1), Tetradecanoic (14:0) and Pentadecenoic (15:1) were found in of *Pantoeaspp*. (P<sub>1</sub>), in high percentage 24.97%, 23.07% and 24.39% respectively, while these fatty acids were found in P<sub>2</sub> and P<sub>3</sub> isolates of *Pantoea* spp. in low percentage. The number of fatty acids found in of *Pseudomonas* spp. (Ps<sub>1</sub>) were less than the number of fatty acids which found in Ps2 isolate.

The fatty acids Tridecanoic (13:0), Tetradecanoic (14:0) and Pentadecenoic (15:1) were found in *Xanthomonas* spp. (X<sub>1</sub>) in high percentage 35.85%, 23.06% and 26.78% in order given, while they were found in X<sub>2</sub> isolate in low percentage 10.06%, 0.77% and 6.39% respectively. Tridecanoic acid (13:0) and Pentadecenoic acid (15:1) were found in all previous isolates. Undecanoic (11:0), Heptadecanoic (17:0), Linoleic (18:2c) and Eicosatrienoic acids (20:3w6) were absent in P<sub>1</sub>, P<sub>2</sub>, P<sub>3</sub>, Ps<sub>1</sub> and X<sub>2</sub> isolates, while they were found in  $X_2$  and  $X_1$  isolates. Dodecanoic acid (12:0) and Octadecanoic acid (18:0) were found in all isolates except Ps<sub>1</sub> and X<sub>1</sub> isolates, respectively.

Table 4 Relative f	fatty acid c	compositions (	of tested	bacterial	isolates

Fatty acid(FA	AMEs)			В	acterial i	solates		
Shorthand	G44*	<b>P</b> <sub>1</sub>	$P_2$	<b>P</b> <sub>3</sub>	Ps <sub>1</sub>	Ps <sub>2</sub>	$X_1$	$\mathbf{X}_2$
designation	Systematic name	Fatty acids (% of the total fatty acids)						
C 11:0	Undecanoic	-	-	-	-	0.10	0.70	-
C 12:0	Dodecanoic	8.56	0.23	0.13	-	0.18	6.15	0.22
C 13:0	Tridecanoic	8.97	7.48	8.05	2.78	0.06	35.85	10.06
C 14 : 1	Tetradecenoic	24.97	4.27	4.95	1.60	6.32	22.45	5.74
C 14 : 0	Tetradecanoic	23.07	0.59	0.68	0.12	6.11	23.06	0.77
C 15 : 1	Pentadecenoic	24.39	3.88	5.28	1.64	6.63	26.78	6.39
C 15 : 0	Pentadecanoic	21.63	0.31	-	-	5.67	21.36	5.24
C 16 : 1	Hexadecenoic	10.20	0.23	0.12	0.51	2.91	2.01	0.93
C 16 : 0	Hexadecanoic	15.80	3.53	3.53	-	5.33	10.32	1.85
C 17 : 1	Heptadecenoic	3.77	-	-	-	0.09	0.57	-
C 17:0	Heptadecanoic	-	-	-	-	0.46	0.58	-
C 18 : 3	Octadecatrienoic	-	-	-	-	0.09	2.82	0.07
C 18 : 2 c	Linoleic	-	-	-	-	0.61	1.66	-
C 18 : 2 t	Linolelaidic	2.03	0.42	-	0.14	4.04	-	0.44
C 18 : 1 c	Vaccenic	-	-	0.41	-	-	0.56	-
C 18 : 1 t	Octadecenoic	5.57	1.09	0.51	0.19	-	-	-
C 18:0	Octadecanoic	1.53	0.37	0.39	0.14	1.27	-	0.51
C 20 : 3w6	Eicosatrienoic	-	-	-	-	0.13	3.96	-

-, Not detected; P1, P2, P3, Pantoea spp. isolates; Ps1, Ps2, Pseudomonas spp. isolates; X1, X2, Xanthomonas spp. isolates

## Molecular identification through 16S rRNA gene

The following partial sequences were obtained for *Pantoea* spp. isolates  $P_1$ ,  $P_2$  and  $P_3$ ,*Psendomonas* spp. isolates  $P_5$ ,  $P_5_2$  and *Xanthomonas* spp. isolates  $X_1$  and  $X_2$ . Search in databases to identify the bacteria was achieved in BLAST search at the NCBI. The search revealed that the sequence corresponding to each individual isolate of  $P_1$ ,  $P_2$  and  $P_3$  was almost identical (99% homology) to that of *Pantoea ananatis* whereas, the sequence of each of the Ps1 and  $P_5_2$  was almost similar to that of *Psendomonas syringae* pv. *tomato*. The Genbank accession numbers of the bacterial isolates were listed in Table (5). While the sequence of each of the  $X_1$  and  $X_2$  was almost similar (97% homology) to that of *Xanthomonas vesicatoria*.

 Table 5
 Accession number of partial 16s rRNA gene of Pantoea ananatis,

 Pseudomonas syringe pv. tomato and Xanthomonas vesicatoria isolates in the GenBank

group isolates *Pectobacterium carotovorum* subsp. *carotovorum* "Pcc" (AB680280) and *Erwinia tracheiphila* "E.trach" (NR044924). Cluster II divided into two Sub-clusters: Sub-cluster 1 divided further into two Groups: Group 1 contained the two isolates of *P.ananatis* isolated from tomato  $P_1(LN880270)$  and  $P_2$  (LN880271) besides the *P.ananatis* isolates collected from Genbank. However, Group 2 included only one isolate  $P_3$  (LN880272) which isolated from Black nightshade. Sub-cluster 2 included only one isolate KJ670108 (Fig.10). While, the phylogenetic tree generated for the *Pseudomonas syringae* py.*tomato* 

isolates revealed that two main clusters do exist. Cluster I contained our two isolates  $Ps_1$  (LN880273) and  $Ps_2$  (LN880274). Whereas Cluster II included the other isolates of *Ps. Syringae* pv. tomato collected from Genbank (Fig.11).

In case of phylogenetic tree generated in this study for the *Xanthomonas* vesicatoria isolates revealed that two main clusters do exist. Cluster I included only one isolate KP84443. Cluster II divided into two Sub-clusters: Sub-cluster 1 divided further into two Groups: Group 1 contained the two isolates contained isolates collected from Genbank KU301883, HF585549, AF123088 and **MR0265188 nG**:roup II included the two isolates X<sub>1</sub> (LN880275) and X<sub>2</sub>

Isolate code	Bacterial isolates	<b>NRO25518B nG</b> roup II included the two isolates $X_1$ (LN880275)
P <sub>1</sub>	Pantoea ananatis	(LN38030070Fig.12)
P <sub>2</sub>	Pantoea ananatis	LN880271
P <sub>3</sub>	Pantoea ananatis	LN880272
Ps <sub>1</sub>	Pseudomonas syringae pv. tomato	LN880273
Ps <sub>2</sub>	Pseudomonas syringae pv. tomato	LN880274
$X_1$	Xanthomonas vesicatoria	LN880275
X <sub>2</sub>	Xanthomonas vesicatoria	LN880276

# Alignment and phylogenetic analysis

The phylogenetic tree generated in this study for the *P.ananatis* isolates  $P_1$ ,  $P_2$  and  $P_3$  revealed that two main clusters do exist. Cluster I included the two out-







Figure 11 Phylogenetic tree of *Pseudomonas syringae* pv. *tomato* (Ps1 and Ps2 isolates) obtained in this study and validly related bacteria from the alignment of 16S rRNA sequences. The scale appearing at the bottom indicates linkage distance.



**Figure 12** Phylogenetic tree of *Xanthomonas vesicatoria* (X1 and X2 isolates) obtained in this study and validly related bacteria from the alignment of 16S rRNA sequences. The scale appearing at the bottom indicates linkage distance.

### DISCUSSION

Characterization of the population structure, diversity, and evolution are the main factors for understanding the pathogen biology and providing information necessary for the development of effective means for disease control (Vancheva et al., 2018). Results of the pathological behaviors of the isolated tomato seedborne bacteria, their cultural, morphological and physiological characters, as well as molecular techniques (16S rRNA gene sequence) were indicated that *Pantoea* ananatis was associated with graywall symptoms (Stall et al., 1970), *Pseudomonas syringae* pv. tomato was the causal agent of bacterial speck disease (Abd-Alla and Bashandy, 2008; Milijasevic etal., 2009 and Opara and Odibo 2009; Kolomiets et al., 2017; Roach et al., 2018).

Re-isolation of artificially infected tomato plants indicated that *P.ananatis* was an endophytic seed-borne bacteria, these results were consistent with findings of **Rijavec** *et al.*, (2007), while previous results were in contrast with **Cota** *et al.*, (2010). Whereas re-isolation of *Ps.syringae* pv. *tomato* from seeds proved that it's an epiphytic seed-borne. These results were matched with findings of **Hirano** and Upper, (2000), while it's were in disagreed with **Ferrando** *et al.*, (2012). Results discovered that *X.vesicatoria* was an epiphytic and endophytic seed-borne, these results were fixed with **Kniskern** *et al.*, (2007).

Fatty acids profiling is a useful tool for identification and classification of plant pathogenic bacteria. It is potentially an extremely powerful predictive tool (Stead 1992 and Weller *et al.* 2000). Isolates of *P.ananatis* were distinguished by the ratios of fatty acids (12:0,14:0 and 18:0), that similarly mimics to the findings of Nischwitz *et al.*, (2007). As well as, isolates of *Ps. s.* pv. *tomato* were distinguished by the ratios of fatty acids (14:0 and 16:1), that similarly mimics to the findings of Denny, (1988). In case of isolates of *X. c.* pv. *vesicatoria* were distinguished by the ratios of fatty acids (14:0, 15:0 and 16:0), that similarly corresponded withVauterin *et al.*, (1996) and Obradovicet *al.*, (2004).

The use of 16S rRNA gene sequences to study bacterial phylogeny and taxonomy has been by far the most common housekeeping genetic marker (Ashmawy et al., 2020). 16S rRNAgene was used to identify the tested isolates and study the genetic variability among 3 isolates of *Pantoea* spp., 2 isolates of *Pseudomonas* spp. and 2 isolates of *Xanthomonas* spp. Results obtained of all tested isolates gave one band in the right expected molecular length. DNA sequences of tested isolates revealed that the sequences belong to *P.ananatis*, *P. syringae* pv. tomato and *X. campestris* pv. vesicatoria. Such findings agreed with data obtained with Krawczyket al., (2010) and Mbegaet al., (2012).

The bacterium associated with the tomato (*Solanum esculentum*) and the alternative host black nightshade (*S. nigrum*) seeds appeared to be *P. ananatis* on the basis of 16S rRNA gene sequence. This apparently is the first report of *P. ananatis* as a bacterial pathogen isolated from tomato and black nightshade seeds in Egypt. Alternative hosts such as several crop and weed species have been suspected to potentially play a role in the spread or survival of bacterial diseases (**Ocimati et al., 2018**). The current study determined the potential risk posed by black nightshade (*S. nigrum*) as alternative hosts to *P. ananatis*.

# REFERENCES

Abdalla, M. E. (2000). Detection and identification of seed-borne pathogenic bacteria of imported tomato seeds in Egypt. *EPPO Bulletin*, 30(2), 327-331. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2338.2000.tb00904.x

Abd-Alla, M. H. (2008). Bacterial wilt and spot of tomato caused by Xanthomonas vesicatoria and Ralstonia solanacearum in Egypt. *World Journal of Microbiology and Biotechnology*, 24(2), 291-292. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11274-007-9385-8

Ashmawy, N. A., Jadalla, N. M., Shoeib, A. A., & El-Bebany, A. F. (2015). Identification and genetic characterization of Pectobacterium spp. and related Enterobacteriaceae causing potato soft rot diseases in Egypt. *J. Pure Appl. Microbiol*, 9(3), 1847-1858.

Ashmawy, N. A., El-Bebany, A. F., Shams, A. H., & Shoeib, A. A. (2020). Identification and differentiation of soft rot and blackleg bacteria from potato using nested and multiplex PCR. *Journal of Plant Diseases and Protection*, *127*,141–153. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s41348-019-00257-1</u>

AL-Saleh, M. A. (2011). Pathogenic variability among five bacterial isolates of Xanthomonas campestris pv. vesicatoria, causing spot disease on tomato and their response to salicylic acid. *Journal of the Saudi Society of Agricultural Sciences*, *10*(1), 47-51. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jssas.2010.08.001</u>

Boyle, J. S. (1994). Abnormal ripening of tomato fruit. *Plant disease*, 78(10), 936-944.

Brady, C. L., Venter, S. N., Cleenwerck, I., Engelbeen, K., Vancanneyt, M., Swings, J., & Coutinho, T. A. (2009). Pantoea vagans sp. nov., Pantoea eucalypti sp. nov., Pantoea deleyi sp. nov. and Pantoea anthophila sp. nov. *International journal of systematic and evolutionary microbiology*, *59*(9), 2339-2345. https://doi.org/10.1099/ijs.0.009241-0

Brenner, W. G., Romanov, G. A., Köllmer, I., Bürkle, L., & Schmülling, T. (2005). Immediate-early and delayed cytokinin response genes of Arabidopsis thaliana identified by genome-wide expression profiling reveal novel cytokininsensitive processes and suggest cytokinin action through transcriptional cascades. *The Plant Journal*, 44(2), 314-333. <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-313X.2005.02530.x</u>

Cota, L. V., Costa, R. V., Silva, D. D., Parreira, D. F., Lana, U. G. P., & Casela, C. R. (2010). First report of pathogenicity of Pantoea ananatis in sorghum (Sorghum bicolor) in Brazil. *Australasian Plant Disease Notes*, *5*(1), 120-122.

Coutinho, T. A., & Venter, S. N. (2009). Pantoea ananatis: an unconventional

plant pathogen. *Molecular plant pathology*, *10*(3), 325-335. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1364-3703.2009.00542.x

Delétoile, A., Decré, D., Courant, S., Passet, V., Audo, J., Grimont, P., ... & Brisse, S. (2009). Phylogeny and identification of Pantoea species and typing of Pantoea agglomerans strains by multilocus gene sequencing. *Journal of clinical microbiology*, *47*(2), 300-310.

Denny, T. P. (1988). Phenotypic diversity in Pseudomonas syringae pv. tomato. *Microbiology*, *134*(7), 1939-1948. <u>https://doi.org/10.1099/00221287-134-7-1939</u>

El-meneisy, A.Z A. (2005).Studies on foliar bacterial diseases of tomato. M.Sc. thesis, Faculty of Agriculture, Ain Shams University, 132 pp.

Fao, 2018. FAOSTAT statistical database. Rome. (available at http://faostat.fao.org).

Ferrando, L., Mañay, J. F., & Scavino, A. F. (2012). Molecular and culturedependent analyses revealed similarities in the endophytic bacterial community composition of leaves from three rice (Oryza sativa) varieties. *FEMS microbiology ecology*, 80(3), 696-708. <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1574-6941.2012.01339.x</u>

Gitaitis, R. D., Chang, C. J., Sijam, K., & Dowler, C. C. (1991). A differential medium for the semiselective isolation of Xanthomonas campestris pv. vesicatoria and other cellulolytic xanthomonads from various natural sources. *Plant disease*, 75(12), 1274-1278.

Gitaitis, R., & Walcott, R. (2007). The epidemiology and management of seedborne bacterial diseases. *Annu. Rev. Phytopathol.*, *45*, 371-397. https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.phyto.45.062806.094321

Gore, J. P., & O'Garro, L. W. (1999). Xanthomonas campestris pv. vesicatoria from bell pepper and tomato in Barbados undergoes changes in race structure, virulence and sensitivity to chemical control agents. *Journal of Phytopathology*, *147*(7-8), 397-402. <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1439-0434.1999.tb03840.x</u>

Goszczynska, T., Moloto, V. M., Venter, S. N., & Coutinho, T. A. (2006). Isolation and identification of Pantoea ananatis from onion seed in South Africa. *Seed Science and Technology*, *34*(3), 655-668. https://doi.org/10.15258/sst.2006.34.3.12

Goszczynska, T., Venter, S. N., & Coutinho, T. A. (2006). PA 20, a semiselective medium for isolation and enumeration of Pantoea ananatis. *Journal of microbiological methods*, *64*(2), 225-231. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.mimet.2005.05.004

Hirano, S. S., & Upper, C. D. (2000). Bacteria in the leaf ecosystem with emphasis onPseudomonas syringae—a pathogen, ice nucleus, and epiphyte. *Microbiol. Mol. Biol. Rev.*, 64(3), 624-653.

Kates, M. (1972). *Techniques of lipidology*. North-Holland/American Elsevier, P.351.

Kniskern, J. M., Traw, M. B., & Bergelson, J. (2007). Salicylic acid and jasmonic acid signaling defense pathways reduce natural bacterial diversity on Arabidopsis thaliana. *Molecular plant-microbe interactions*, 20(12), 1512-1522. https://doi.org/10.1094/MPMI-20-12-1512

Kumar, S., Stecher, G., & Tamura, K. (2016). MEGA7: molecular evolutionary genetics analysis version 7.0 for bigger datasets. *Molecular biology and evolution*, 33(7), 1870-1874. <u>https://doi.org/10.1093/molbev/msw054</u>

Kolomiets, J. V., Grygoryuk, I. P., & Butsenko, L. M. (2017). Bacterial diseases of tomato plants in terms of open and covered growing of Ukraine. *Annals of Agrarian Science*, *15*(2), 213-216. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aasci.2017.05.010</u>

Krawczyk, K., Kamasa, J., Zwolinska, A., & Pospieszny, H. (2010). First report of Pantoea ananatis associated with leaf spot disease of maize in Poland. *Journal of Plant Pathology*, 807-811.

Manjula, C. P., Kumar, M. K. P., & Basha, C. R. J. (2017). Studies on variations among prevailing races of Xanthomonas vesicatoria causing bacterial spot of tomato in Karnataka. *Journal of Mycopathological Research*, *54*(4), 503-510.

Mbega, E. R., Wulff, E. G., Mabagala, R. B., Adriko, J., Lund, O. S., & Mortensen, C. N. (2012). Xanthomonads and other yellow-pigmented Xanthomonas-like bacteria associated with tomato seeds in Tanzania. *African Journal of Biotechnology*, *11*(78), 14297-14304. https://doi.org/10.5897/AJB12.1305

Meguire, R. G., Jones, J. B., & Sasser, M. (1986). Tween media for semiselective isolation of Xanthomonas campestris pv. vesicatoria from soil and plant material. *Plant Disease*, *70*, 887-889.

MILIJAŠEVIĆ, S., TODOROVIĆ, B. I. L. J. A. N. A., Rekanović, E., Potočnik, I., & Gavrilović, V. (2009). Races and hosts of Pseudomonas syringae pv. tomato in Serbia. *Archives of Biological Sciences*, 61(1), 93-103. https://doi.org/10.2298/ABS0901093M

Nischwitz, C., Gitaitis, R., Sanders, H., Langston, D., Mullinix, B., Torrance, R., ... & Zolobowska, L. (2007). Use of fatty acid methyl ester profiles to compare copper-tolerant and copper-sensitive strains of Pantoea ananatis. *Phytopathology*, 97(10), 1298-1304. <u>https://doi.org/10.1094/PHYTO-97-10-1298</u>

Obradovic, A., Mavridis, A., Rudolph, K., Janse, J. D., Arsenijevic, M., Jones, J. B., ... & Wang, J. F. (2004). Characterization and PCR-based typing of Xanthomonas campestris pv. vesicatoria from peppers and tomatoes in Serbia. *European Journal of Plant Pathology*, *110*(3), 285-292.

Ocimati, W., Were, E., Groot, J. C., Tittonell, P., Nakato, G. V., & Blomme, G. (2018). Risks posed by intercrops and weeds as alternative hosts to Xanthomonas campestris pv. musacearum in banana fields. *Frontiers in plant science*, *9*, 1471. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpls.2018.01471

Opara, E. U., & Odibo, F. J. C. (2009). Studies and characterization of Bacterial spot pathogen of Tomato Xanthomonas campestris pv. vesicatoria. *Journal of Molecular Genetics*, *1*, 35-43.

Radwan, S. S. (1978). Coupling of two-dimensional thin-layer chromatography with gas chromatography for the quantitative analysis of lipid classes and their constituent fatty acids. *Journal of Chromatographic Science*, *16*(11), 538-542. https://doi.org/10.1093/chromsci/16.11.538

Rijavec, T., Lapanje, A., Dermastia, M., & Rupnik, M. (2007). Isolation of bacterial endophytes from germinated maize kernels. *Canadian journal of microbiology*, 53(6), 802-808. <u>https://doi.org/10.1139/W07-048</u>

Roach, R., Mann, R., Gambley, C. G., Shivas, R. G., & Rodoni, B. (2018). Identification of Xanthomonas species associated with bacterial leaf spot of tomato, capsicum and chilli crops in eastern Australia. *European Journal of Plant Pathology*, *150*(3), 595-608. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10658-017-1303-9

Sahln, F. (2001). Severe outbreak of bacterial speck, caused by Pseudomonassyringae pv. tomato, on field-grown tomatoes in the eastern Anatolia region ofTurkey. Plantpathology, 50(6).http://dx.doi.org/10.1046/j.1365-3059.2001.00622.x

Shenge, K. C., Mabagala, R. B., & Mortensen, C. N. (2010). Current status of bacterial-speck and-spot diseases of tomato in three tomato-growing regions of Tanzania. *Journal of Agricultural Extension and Rural Development*, 2(5), 84-88. Shin, G. Y., Schachterle, J. K., Shyntum, D. Y., Moleleki, L. N., Coutinho, T. A., & Sundin, G. W. (2019). Functional Characterization of a Global Virulence Regulator Hfq and Identification of Hfq-Dependent sRNAs in the Plant Pathogen Pantoea ananatis. *Frontiers in microbiology*, *10*, 2075. https://doi.org/10.3389/fmicb.2019.02075

Stall, R., Alexander, L., & Hall, C. (1970). Effect of tobacco mosaic virus and bacterial infections on occurrence of graywall of tomato[*Erwinia* ananas]. Proceedings of the Florida State Horticultural Society, 1969, 82, 157-61.

Stead, D. E. (1992). Grouping of plant-pathogenic and some other Pseudomonas spp. by using cellular fatty acid profiles. *International Journal of Systematic and Evolutionary Microbiology*, *42*(2), 281-295. <u>https://doi.org/10.1099/00207713-42-2-281</u>

Vauterin, L., Yang, P., & Swings, J. (1996). Utilization of fatty acid methyl esters for the differentiation of new Xanthomonas species. *International Journal of Systematic and Evolutionary Microbiology*, 46(1), 298-304. https://doi.org/10.1099/00207713-46-1-298

Vancheva, T., Stoyanova, M., Tasheva-Terzieva, E., Bogatzevska, N., & Moncheva, P. (2018). Molecular methods for diversity assessment among xanthomonads of Bulgarian and Macedonian pepper. *brazilian journal of microbiology*, *49*, 246-259. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.bjm.2017.08.011

Walterson, A. M., & Stavrinides, J. (2015). Pantoea: insights into a highly versatile and diverse genus within the Enterobacteriaceae. *FEMS Microbiology Reviews*, *39*(6), 968-984. <u>https://doi.org/10.1093/femsre/fuv027</u>

Weller, S. A., Elphinstone, J. G., Smith, N. C., Boonham, N., & Stead, D. (2000). Detection of Ralstonia solanacearumstrains with a quantitative, multiplex, realtime, fluorogenic PCR (TaqMan) assay. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.*, 66(7), 2853-2858.

Yahiaoui-Zaidi, R., Jouan, B., & Andrivon, D. (2003). Biochemical and molecular diversity among Erwinia isolates from potato in Algeria. *Plant pathology*, 52(1), 28-40. https://doi.org/10.1046/j.1365-3059.2003.00791.x